

The “Second” Bride: The Retranslation of Romance Novels

AUTHORS

Zi-ying Lee

Wenzao Ursuline University of Languages

lorrine@mail.wzu.edu.tw

Min-Hsiu Liao

Heriot-Watt University

m.liao@hw.ac.uk

ABSTRACT

This article contributes to the discussion of retranslation in Translation Studies, with a case study on the retranslation of romance novels in Taiwan. Although retranslation has received some attention from translation researchers, most of the existing studies are based on examples of classic literature. In contrast, popular fictions such as the romance novel remain relatively under-researched. In this paper, paratextual analysis is applied to the publishing environment and marketing strategies of romance novels, in order to explain why works of this genre — which are usually regarded as cheap

and ‘throwaway’ — are re-translated, and how consumers are motivated to purchase such products. Our findings suggest that the retranslation of best-selling romantic novels is a low-cost and low-risk investment for the publishers involved. Such retranslations are promoted through three channels: via the branding of the retranslation as a ‘classic’; by persuading readers to believe that the retranslated version is more faithful to the original, and thus superior, and by introducing a different mode of consumption – a shift away from renting and towards the purchase of novels. We argue that for commercially-driven retranslations, market factors, rather than the inherent features of the texts concerned, provide a clearer explanation for the phenomenon of retranslation.

KEYWORDS: retranslation, romance novels, paratexts

Résumé

Dans le cadre des Etudes de Traduction, cet article désire apporter sa contribution au débat portant sur la retraduction en examinant le cas des romans romanesques populaires sur le marché de l'Édition à Taiwan. Bien que les chercheurs dans le domaine de la Traduction lui aient porté quelque attention, la plupart des études ont

surtout été consacrées à la retraduction de la littérature classique, alors qu'on s'est peu préoccupé de la fiction populaire. Notre analyse paratextuelle examine le marché de l'édition du roman et ses stratégies de marketing pour expliquer les raisons des éditeurs de retraduire et publier des romans romanesques - un genre généralement considéré comme bon marché et sans valeur de collection -et comment le consommateur est motivé pour acheter ce produit. Les résultats (de notre analyse) suggèrent que la retraduction des romans précédemment repris dans la liste des Best-Sellers représente un investissement peu coûteux et peu risqué pour les éditeurs. La promotion des retraductions se fait de trois manières: désigner la retraduction comme classique; persuader le lecteur qu'une version fidèle est meilleure; et enfin, introduire un nouveau mode de consommation - soit passer de l'emprunt à l'achat -.Nous estimons que - dans le domaine de la retraduction commerciale - ce sont les impératifs du marché qui dominant le phénomène de la retraduction plutôt que le caractère du texte même.

Mots-clefs: retraduction, romans romanesques, paratextes

The “Second” Bride: The Retranslation of Romance Novels

1. The Phenomenon of Retranslation

This article aims to contribute to the discussion of retranslation within Translation Studies, with a case study focusing on retranslation of popular romance novels.

Although retranslation has received some attention from translation scholars, almost all existing studies are based on classic or ‘highbrow’ literature, such as *The Thousand and One Nights* (Paloposki and Koskinen 2004); *Alice’s Adventures in Wonderland* (Koskinen and Paloposki 2003); Zola’s *Nana* (Brownlie 2006); The Swedish Nobel Prize Winner Selma Lagerlöf’s children’s book *Nils Holgerssons underbara resa genom Sverige* (Desmidt 2009); *Madam Bovary* (Deane-Cox 2014); *Tess of the D’Urbervilles* (Xiang 2012) and *Robinson Crusoe* (Taivalkoski-Shilov 2015). Others are non-literary texts, but nonetheless influential theoretical works, such as Roland Barthe’s essays (Susam-Sarajeva 2003). Studies of popular culture, such as Greenall’s (2015) research of the retranslation of Bob Dylan’s songs into Norwegian, are exceptional. This is perhaps because a classic work is more likely to be re-translated than a non-classic, and consequently more likely to be studied.

However, the phenomenon of retranslation is certainly not restricted to classics alone, and in this article we will present a case study based on popular romance novels, which are often regarded as ‘lowbrow’ literature. It is hoped that this contribution, focusing on a less studied genre, will provide new insight to the study of retranslation that is currently dominated by classics.

Let us begin with a review of the existing studies on the phenomenon of retranslation. Although in some contexts retranslation is understood as a synonym of relay translation or indirect translation, it is now more commonly defined as “a second or later translation of a single source text into the same target language” (Koskinen and Paloposki 2010, 294). The level of debate around this phenomenon has increased since the formulation of *rettranslation hypothesis* as a potential universal feature of retranslation. This hypothesis states that “later translations tend to be closer to the source text” (Chesterman 2004, 8). Since its inception, this hypothesis has been tested, substantiated and challenged, and has generated a wave of investigation in this area.

The possible reasons for retranslations that have been discussed in previous studies can be broadly summarized in the following terms. One, probably the most

innocent reason for retranslation, can be that the second translator is simply not aware of the existence of a first translation. Alternatively, the second translation may be commissioned for a different audience and/or for a different purpose than was the case for its predecessor, such as the retranslation of a piece of classic literature for children.

One commonly perceived reason for retranslation is that the second translation is produced because the first translation is of poor quality. Very often this perception of poor quality is not necessarily related to any incompetence on the part of the first translator, but simply reflects the idea that the first translation has aged – as time passes, the use of the target language (TL) has changed and therefore the first translation is no longer as easily understood by the target readers as it was by previous generations.

In other cases, it is not a change in language *per se* that prompts a new translation, but the fact that the target norm has changed. For example, if a society's attitude towards a topic or an ideology has altered, a second translation may be commissioned in order to present a translation more adequate for the context. In fact, not only may the TL culture interpret the source text (ST) differently, the ST itself

may also evolve and be understood differently over time, and therefore require retranslations – religious texts such as *The Bible* are clear examples of this. In such cases, it may be argued that it is “not only justified but actually necessary to have new translations.” (Almberg 2001, 928)

These reasons have been yielded by case studies drawn mainly from classic literature, and we can clearly see how some of them are unlikely to apply to the retranslation of a popular romance novel. For example, a need for the target or the source society to re-interpret such texts, and therefore to require retranslation, is unlikely – it is difficult to imagine scholars studying popular romance novels over and over again in order to give them new meanings. The issue of language ageing also seems unlikely to apply to romance novels, because such texts usually have a shorter product life cycle, unlike classics that may last for hundreds of years and therefore witness changes in linguistic and cultural norms. Further discussion of how the existing retranslation studies cannot fully explain the retranslation of romance novels will be presented after this genre is introduced in the next section.

When considering the case study of this paper, the authors feel that the reasons underlying the retranslation of popular romance novels cannot be found within their

own inherent textual features, but must be sought amongst the factors affecting the markets and industry of romance publishing. It is under this premise we find Koskinen and Paloposki (2003) who bring factors from the publishing market of the retranslation into discussion in a particularly helpful and relevant way. This work points out that unlike the so-called ‘highbrow’ literature which may be published for its cultural values, the driving force behind mass-production publication is predominantly “the aim of commercial interests” (Koskinen and Paloposki 2003, 26). With this commercial reality in mind, Koskinen and Paloposki (ibid.) argues that retranslation is considered desirable because “one obvious strategy for reducing publishing costs is recycling”. Retranslating texts that have previously proven themselves as bestsellers is not only a low-cost, but also a low-risk, investment.

Regarding retranslation as a market strategy also allows us to reconsider all the features associated with retranslations previously discussed – for example the claims that retranslations tend to be classics, and that later translations tend to be closer to the ST. Are these inherent features of retranslations, or are they “more a mindset, a rationale, than a feature of retranslations” (Koskinen and Paloposki 2003, 32)? A similar argument is put forward by Venuti (2004), who contends that a piece of work may be retranslated because it *is* a classic, but conversely, that the process of

retranslation also helps to establish a piece of work *as* a classic. He further argues that “the claims of the inadequacy or insufficiency of a previous translation may be part of a strategic repositioning aimed at supporting the value of the new translation either by the retranslator, or by the others involved” (Venuti 2004, 26). Clearly, popular romance novels are not retranslated because they are classics, so what interests us is the question of how new values are created in retranslations.

Based on the arguments put forward by Koskinen and Paloposki (2003) and Venuti (2004), the authors of this paper have carried out an empirical study to explore relevant paratextual features, such as book advertising, translators’ statements and readers’ responses. Before we move to the analysis, it is helpful to have an overview of the genre of romance novels and of previous research of the translation of this genre.

2. The Genre of Romance Novels

There has been a trend to retranslate romance novels in Taiwan since 2010. This phenomenon presents a very different case study subject from the highbrow works

explored in previous studies of retranslation, because romance novels are typically perceived as “an inferior type of cultural production” (Bianchi and D’Arcangelo 2015, 248), despite the popularity and commercial success of this genre throughout the world. In this section we will first introduce the features of this genre, highlighting how it may challenge the retranslation hypothesis. In the section following that, we contextualize the publishing market in Taiwan and present the case study focusing on a romance novel, *The Bride*.

It should be made clear that this paper explores a very narrow category of romance novels, i.e., it restricts itself to those romance novels that are published for the mass market and observe a strict formula in terms of narrative. Therefore, other types of novel which may be regarded elsewhere, under a broader definition, as romance, such as the work of Jane Austen, are not covered in this study. Ramsdell (2012) provides a detailed definition for the type of romance novel upon which this study focuses:

[a] love story in which the central focus is on the development and satisfactory resolution of the love relationship between the two main characters, written in

such a way as to provide the reader with some degree of vicarious participation in the courtship process. (Ramsdell 2012, 6)

The Association of the Romance Writers of America (RWA), the membership of which comprises more than ten thousand romance writers in over 35 countries, highlights two essential elements as being crucial to every romance novel: “a central love story and an emotionally satisfying and optimistic ending¹.” A central love story refers to the idea that the story must revolve around the development of relationship between protagonists, although the authors have the freedom to create various subplots. The second element requires all novels to have a happy ending – all of the struggles of love that occur throughout the development of the story have to be “rewarded with emotional justice and unconditional love².” Barlow and Krentz (1992) go so far as to say that “should the writer be unable to create the fantasy satisfactorily, make it accessible, and achieve the integration of opposites that results in a happy ending, the reader will consider herself cheated.” (Barlow and Krentz 1992, 20)

¹ “About the romance genre,” *Romance Writers of America*. Accessed September 1, 2016, <https://www.rwa.org/Romance>

² “About the romance genre,” *Romance Writers of America*. Accessed September 1, 2016, <https://www.rwa.org/Romance>

A direct result of this straightforward formulation of the genre is a sub-genre, named category romances, explained by RWA as “books issued under a common imprint/series name that are usually numbered sequentially and released at regular intervals, usually monthly, with the same number of releases each time³.” The Canadian publisher Harlequin is the largest supplier of category romance. A large volume of category romance novels are produced and translated at great speed, and are consumed by a market estimated to include more than 50 million women worldwide, particularly women aged 35-55 (Paizis 1998). According to the 2014 statistics published by RWA, 64% of these consumers read romance novels more than once a month and 35% of them purchase romance novels more than once a month⁴.

The generic features of romance novels should lead us to consider how unlikely it is that any romance novel would be retranslated if the arguments, presented in the previous section under retranslation theory, are applicable in all cases. As we have pointed out, this type of novel has a very restricted target of purpose and readership, so there is little likelihood that a need will arise for re-interpretation of the ST, or to

³ “About the romance genre,” *Romance Writers of America*. Accessed September 1, 2016, <https://www.rwa.org/Romance>

⁴ “Romance readers statistics,” *Romance Writers of America*. Accessed September 1, 2016, <https://www.rwa.org/p/cm/ld/fid=582>

recreate the target text (TT) for a different purpose or readership. More importantly, the production model of category romances means that the value of any *one* individual book is rarely appreciated – after all, it is just one of a kind that is published monthly in a vast quantity. The consumers involved regularly read and buy new books. The Harlequin books “are sold by brand name rather than by author or title” (Paizis 1998, 2). The genre is in general perceived as cheap, disposable, and of little value to collectors (Yang 2015, 41). Therefore, there seems to be no reason for an individual book to be revisited and retranslated, if we consider only the inherent features of the book as explanatory of retranslation; and that is precisely why we argue that market factors must be taken into consideration.

The low value of each individual book, given the massive production model of category romances, may also explain why this genre has received little attention from academics, including translation researchers. However, amidst the few translation studies that have explored this genre, a few interesting facts can be observed. There are studies of romance novels based on a range of global regions, such as France and Greece (Paizis 1998), the Arab World (Al-Bataineh 1998), Japan (Shibamoto Smith 2005), Taiwan (Liu 2012), Turkey (Schell 2013) and Italy (Bianchi and D’Arcangelo 2015). On the one hand, this shows that retranslation of romance novels is a global

phenomenon. On the other hand, this global trend of translation is characterized by its uniformity. These studies are almost all based on source texts published by Harlequin, or its partnerships such as Mills and Boon in the UK.

In terms of data analysis, studies that have carried out micro-level linguistic analysis mostly notice a degree of adaptation in the TTs. For example, Paizis (1998) identified eliminations in the French translation. Other studies exploring paratextual features also find that translators of romance novels seem to enjoy a high degree of freedom to adapt their translation – for example, “near-complete autonomy in her interpretation of the source-text” in the case of Turkish translators (Schell 2013, 161). Bianchi and D’Arcangelo (2015, 252) quote a senior editor at Harlequin Mondadori, based in Italy, as stating that translators are expected to make adaptations if they consider that target readers may find any expressions distasteful. These observations suggest that in the translation of category romance, a degree of re-writing is acceptable, and faithfulness to the ST is not considered the top priority. This again leads us to question the motivation of the retranslation of romance novels, since many of the discussions of retranslation highlight that a second translation may at times be demanded because the first translation is deemed inaccurate or insufficiently faithful to the original.

3. A case study: *The Bride* in Taiwan

Since the 1960s, translations of romance novels that were originally written by Anglo-Saxon authors have been introduced to Taiwan. The initial popularity of these translated books led to a boom in demand for translated romance novels from the 1970s to the 1990s (Liu 2012). According to the analysis of Liu (2012), several market factors contributed to this success: first, translations were not heavily regulated by the copyright regulations in Taiwan, so publishers could publish translated romance novels at low cost, incurring just a small translation fee. Second, the majority of translated romance novels were not sold directly to readers, but rather to book rental stores. These rental stores purchased romance novels in large quantities at low cost. Customers would pay a small amount of money to either read the books in the shop, or take them at home for a limited period of time. Readers often preferred renting to buying because although romance novels are consumed regularly, it is rare for any single book to be read more than once. Liu (2012) concludes that this marketing channel has guaranteed publishers stable sales, and is key to the success of the romance novels in Taiwan.

However, in the early 1990s, the Taiwanese market for translated romance novels faced new challenges. Stricter regulations on copyright came into force in 1992, leading to an increase in the cost of publishing translated romances.

Furthermore, two decades since the introduction of this genre, local Taiwanese romance writers who “copied the success formula of translation romances, [and] injected their work with elements from Chinese culture” (Liu 2012, v) now threatened the sales of translated romance novels. Since 2000, both translated and non-translated romance in Taiwan has been forced to compete with free online romance coming from mainland China, and the marketing channel of the genre, based on book rental stores, has proved to be unsustainable. As rental stores close down, publishers are struggling to survive.

However, since the year 2010, some Taiwanese publishers have begun to publish the retranslations of English category romance novels which were first published twenty years ago. It is in this market context that we wish to revisit the retranslation phenomenon. *The Bride* is one of the retranslations generated by this trend.

The English version of category romance *The Bride* was first published in the U.S. in 1989. Its author, Julie Garwood, is one of the most celebrated of romance writers, having sold more than 35 million books and written 26 *New York Times* bestsellers. A translation of *The Bride* was first published in Taiwan in 1991 by Lin Po Publishing Company, and the retranslation was published by Star East Press in 2012.

This novel is a historical romance, set at the time when King Henry I of England inherited the throne. The story tells of the initial tension and eventual union between Jamie, the young and courageous heroine who is not afraid to challenge the social norms of the time, and her husband Alec, a brave and somewhat stubborn Scottish laird. The two are forced to marry by the edict of King Henry I. Two central elements of the genre can be identified here: a central story between Jamie and Alec – with the tension between the English and the Scottish as the background, and an expected happy ending. This book was the winner of The Best Single Title Historical Romance in 1990, awarded by the Romance Writers of America, and of the Romance Readers Anonymous (RRA) Award in 1996.

4. Paratexts of (re)translation

In this research we have decided to carry out a paratextual, rather than a textual, analysis. This choice of methodology is justified by a number of reasons. First, a comparison of the two translated versions shows a result similar to those of previous studies, i.e., the retranslation is closer to the source text than the first translation. We have found in the first translation frequent eliminations, restructuring of paragraphs, and the conformation of characters' names to the Chinese norms. Therefore, the textual strategies do not seem to challenge the findings of previous studies and certainly cannot explain the question of why this novel was retranslated. Furthermore, as per our argument so far, market factors and strategies seem able to provide a clearer explanation than do its inherent textual features, in the context of our case study.

Paratext, following the definition of Genette (1997) refers to materials that accompany a text. Paratexts such as prefaces, illustrations, or other reviews are often regarded as a supportive element that surrounds the text itself. However, very often the paratextual material actually pre-determines readers' interpretations of the main texts, even before they begin to read the text (Kovala 1996, 141). We argue that this is

particularly the case in the marketing of category romances. As we have seen, romance novels are often sold by brand rather than by each book's individual value, and paratextual features such as advertisements, media reviews and other readers' comments, reach the readers before they read the book and indeed help them to make the decision to do so. Venuti (2004) argues that since a retranslation often needs to highlight its differences from the previous version in order to justify its existence, paratexts such as introductions, academic endorsements and advertisement are effective ways to for those involved in marketing a work to "signal its status as a retranslation and make explicit the competing interpretation that the retranslation has tried to inscribe in the foreign texts" (Venuti 2004, 33). Deane-Cox (2014, 30) further states that in the research of retranslation, paratextual data such as book reviews are valuable sources to shed light on how the second translated version is to be compared with the previous versions by the readers.

Genette (1997) divides paratext into two types: peritext and epitext. Peritext is formed of materials that are situated around the text, such as book titles, prefaces, illustrations and blurb. Epitext, on the other hand, is distanced materials that are located outside texts such as interviews with authors, comments upon and reviews of books, etc. For the purpose of the present study, both peritext and epitext materials are

included. Peritext evidence is collected from the English version and the two Chinese translations of *The Bride* that have been published in Taiwan, and includes features such as the cover designs, prefaces, blurbs, and belly bands. Epitext materials include advertisements for and reviews of the publications as posted on the biggest online bookstore in Taiwan, which is *Books.com* (www.books.com.tw), as well as readers' comments on the website of the fan club *WRN- Western Romance Novel Study Group* (wrn.tw), and the re-translator Adam Tang's personal blog (<http://peartrail.pixnet.net/blog>).

5. Retranslation of *The Bride*

Given the prevailing market factors, it seems reasonable to assume that the resurgence of the retranslated romance novel, which began in 2010, is a strategy used by besieged Taiwanese publishers to cope with a very difficult market. An investment in novels that have sold well in previous translations, seems to be a low-cost and low-risk investment. It is possible that publishers could have found an even cheaper way to re-issue these titles, but as we have seen, the rules surrounding copyright in Taiwan have changed since their first appearance, and because most of the translations published

between 1970 and 1990 have not had appropriate copyrights obtained, it is not possible for them to be re-printed. The success of recent single-volume translated romance novels such as *Fifty Shades of Grey*, may also have encouraged Taiwanese publishers to look at translated novels afresh.

In the following paragraphs we will examine the paratextual features of *The Bride* as an example, in order to discern why romance novels are now being retranslated, or rather, how the retranslation justifies its existence to the readers. It should be noted here that all of the paratextual data are originally written in Mandarin Chinese, and all of the English translations in the square brackets are provided by the authors.

5.1 The Bride has returned as a classic

The first feature we notice in paratexts is a key word: *classic*. The message is clear: *The Bride* is returning as a piece of classic, rather than lowbrow, literature. This can be seen in the book's blurb, for example:

與《傲慢與偏見》同列 20 世紀百大羅曼史排行榜，20 年來人氣始終居高不下的羅曼史浪漫經典！所有愛情小說迷必讀浪漫經典。

[Along with *Pride and Prejudice*, [this book] has been listed among the top 100 most popular romance novels of the 20th century. It has been one of the most popular romance classics for 20 years! This is a romance classic that all fans of romance novels need to read.]

The words *classic* and *everlasting* are also found in another line on the book's blurb:

中世紀的蘇格蘭高地 + 動人的愛情與幽默對話 = 永恆不朽的浪漫傳奇經典

[The Scottish Highlands in the middle ages + Touching love and hilarious conversation = An everlasting, legendary romance classic]

The classicity of *The Bride* is also communicated through the design of the book cover, as was noticed by a reader on the WRN forum:

拿到書時，真的頗為驚艷的，透明壓克力書衣，上面還有銀色的花樣，跟銀色的茱麗·嘉伍德的簽名，再加上淺灰藍色的封面設計，真的超典雅

的。

[I was rather impressed when I received the book – a transparent acrylic book jacket, with silver decorative patterns, Julie Garwood’s signature in silver, and the cover in light grey-blue. This is extremely classic and elegant.]

This is an interesting observation, as we have argued that in many case studies of retranslation the focal works are classics, whereas romance novels are usually regarded as lowbrow literature. The marketing strategy exhibited here shows that a text may be retranslated for reasons other than *because* it is a classic, and indeed it may not be a classic at all, but despite this the retranslation *is constructed* as if it were, or ought to be regarded as, a classic. The book is compared with the romance classic *Pride and Prejudice*, while adjectives such as *everlasting* and *legendary* contribute to build up the image of this work as a classic. Through constructing this novel as a *classic*, it is set apart from the world of everyday category romances, it is no longer just one of the many that are published every month and can be easily replaced by another. The book is still the same as it ever was, and we can say that the interpretation of the source text remains the same, but value has been created. The ST and the TT have been re-categorized, and elevated from lowbrow to classic literature.

5.2 A faithful translation is better

As has been explained in our justification of methodology, our comparison of the first and the second versions of *The Bride* confirms the retranslation hypothesis: the second translation is closer to the ST than the first translation was. In the paratexts, this faithfulness is constructed at least in three ways.

First of all, the *faithfulness* of the retranslation is expressly advertised on the cover: “全新完整中譯版本 [a totally new and complete Chinese translation]”, and elsewhere with a metaphorical description “原汁原味 [with original taste and flavour]”.

Second, the retranslation includes a preface written by the ST author, specifically for Taiwanese readers, in which the author explains her inspiration for this novel and why it is her favourite of all the many books she has written. This ‘physical presence’ of the ST author within the book generates a stronger intertextuality between the ST and TT than would otherwise be the case.

Thirdly, the re-translator states on his personal blog that in re-translating *The Bride*, his aim was to produce a version closer to the ST than the previous translation had been:

舊的版本已經廣為人知，新的版本一定會被拿來和劉莎蘭小姐的舊譯本作比較。我盡力而為，希望新譯本能忠實呈現出原作的全貌。

[The old translation is widely known. It is certain that the new version will be compared with the old version translated by Ms. Sha-lan Liu. I have tried my best with the hope that the new version can show the complete features of the ST faithfully.]

It is interesting to see how heavily the idea of faithfulness is emphasised in this retranslation, since as we have seen in other studies on the translation of romance novels, faithfulness to the ST does not seem to be considered a top priority. On the contrary, a degree of adaptation is taken for granted. Moreover, since romance novels are rarely the subject of academic study, so it is less likely that the ST and TT will ever be closely scrutinised and compared. In other words, unless it is pointed out to the target readers, they are highly unlikely ever to notice this *improvement* within the retranslation.

Furthermore, a given novel is frequently chosen to be retranslated because its first translation sells well (which makes it worthy of re-investment), and this is very likely to be related to its first translation having been well received the first time around. Therefore, we argue that for a popular romance like *The Bride*, the idea of virtuous faithfulness has been constructed as a selling point, rather than being a feature likely to be demanded by its readers. These readers are persuaded by the publisher that this faithful translation is better than the previous translation, thus they conclude it is worth buying.

Several readers' comments on WRN suggest that they do not understand English and have no access to the ST. For example, one reader on WRN commented that only after reading the second version did she realise that the first translation had been an abridged version, but she said:

但對我這種不會原文的人，並不會生氣出版社怎麼可以刪書之類的，當初看新娘時是多麼的喜愛阿!那種喜愛的心情到現在也沒變。

[As a reader who does not understand the source language, I am not annoyed at the publisher's decision to make some cuts to the original. After all I was so

fond of *The Bride* when I first read it. Even today, this fondness has not changed.]

In other words, this reader welcomes the faithful version, but she also very much enjoyed the *unfaithful* version.

Another comment shows how a reader was persuaded to believe that a faithful version is better, in spite of her doubts about the use of TL in the retranslation. She explained that she found a particular lexical choice in the retranslation more difficult to understand than that in the first translation, but added:

因為我是英文白痴，如果原文是貼近這版的意思的話，當然還是這樣比較尊重原著。

[Since I am an idiot when it comes to English, if this translation is closer to the meaning of the ST, certainly this choice would show more respect to the ST.]

This shows that a more faithful translation is not inherently more attractive to readers. It is the belief that a faithful version is better, that makes this retranslation marketable.

The readers' trust in the faithfulness of the retranslation is strengthened by another paratextual feature, which is the credibility of the translator. In the study of paratexts, writers' (and translators') names are often foregrounded as part of the general publicity machinery (Kovala 1996, 137). Inside the front cover of the retranslation of *The Bride*, we found the background of the translator being foregrounded for publicity:

資深羅曼史譯者、作者、研究者。看了 20 幾年羅曼史小說，做了 10 幾年羅曼史翻譯，出過 9 本言情小說，連碩士論文寫的也是美國羅曼史，不僅在國內，在全世界亦是少數美國羅曼史的文本研究先驅。

[An experienced translator, writer, and researcher of romance novels. He has more than twenty years of experience in reading, and more than ten years of experience in translating romance novels. He has published nine romance novels. Even his master's dissertation was devoted to the American romance novel. He is one of the few pioneers in the study of romance texts, not only in Taiwan but also in the world.]

This background concerning the translator provides evidence to readers of his ability to produce a translation that is more faithful to the ST, and generally better,

than the previous translation, and creates added value and attributes it to the retranslation.

5.3 *New readers, old readers*

As was mentioned earlier, Taiwan's romance novel readers usually rented rather than bought their books between 1970 and 1990, so many readers of the first translation of *The Bride* may have enjoyed the novel but did not own it. This has created a marketing opportunity for the retranslation, whereby the publisher can benefit from attracting not only new readers, but also those who read the book years before. The publisher's message tells both markets that because this book is a *classic*, and because a faithful version is *better*, it is worthy of purchase, rather than mere renting: it is a collector's item that readers will want to own. The following passage is found on the belly band of the book:

浪漫小說天后茱麗．嘉伍德幽默感動、令人低迴再三的愛情再次席捲而來，若你曾經錯過，這次，請不要再留下任何遺憾！

[The queen of romance novels, Julie Garwood, has returned with one of her

most hilarious and touching love stories. If you missed it before, don't risk having any regrets this time!]

This passage, interestingly, sends two distinct messages to both new and previous readers. For new or potential new readers, the phrase “if you missed it before” is meaningful, as they have indeed never read this translated romance. For those who have read it, however, the message can be understood as warning that they have missed out on owning the book in the past and should not risk doing so again, or they may regret it — after all, the first translation is now out of print.

Even for those previous readers who have purchased the first translation, there are reasons presented for them to buy the retranslation, too. These reasons are clearly explained in the re-translator's personal blog:

除了翻譯，春光的編輯也非常用心地設計了封面，並請茱麗特別為台灣新譯本撰寫序文，希望除了吸引新讀者，手邊有舊版本的舊讀者也願意重新收藏這本經典之作。

[Apart from [a more faithful] translation, the Star East Press's editor also carefully designed the book cover and invited Julie Garwood to write a preface

specifically for this retranslation in Taiwan. It is hoped that this retranslation will not only attract new readers, but also that previous readers, who had a copy of the old version, will want to collect this classic volume.]

This statement from the re-translator demonstrates how a faithful translation, a re-designed cover, a preface from the ST author, and once again the emphasis on this novel's status as a classic, all contribute to the marketing of this retranslation.

What is more, our observation of the readers' comments do indeed suggest that many of them have read the first translation and are glad to have this opportunity to buy the book now that the first translation is out of print. Here is an example from the *Book.com* website:

沒想到多年後能再次看到它的出版，怎麼能不趕快放到書櫃中珍藏呢？

[I have never imagined that I would see it getting re-published years later. How can I resist storing it in my bookcase straight away?]

To summarise, we argue that the change in the marketing channel used, that is to say the move from rental to purchase, given the prevailing market forces, has made it

commercially advantageous for publishers to issue retranslations. This explanation for the use of retranslation has not been considered in previous studies of retranslation; it seems to be an idiosyncratic feature of a particular market, i.e., the market for translated romance novels in Taiwan. Thus this study finds that for commercially-driven publications, such as popular romance novels, market factors offer clearer explanations of the recent surge in retranslations than textual features do.

6. Conclusion

This study of the retranslation of category romance *The Bride* for the Taiwanese market explores new empirical evidence and offers a new perspective, an addition to those found in existing retranslation studies, which have tended to concentrate their focus on cultural values and phenomena, rather than on market factors.

The key findings of this study can be summarised as follows: first, re-translation of popular romantic novels is presented as a classic. Romance novels are not considered as classic literature based on their cultural values, but in this case study the ST is re-branded as a classic through various paratextual strategies. The construction

of this ‘classicality’ gives such novels a clear appeal in marketing terms – because the retranslated romantic novel is a classic, it is worthy of purchase, or even re-purchase. Second, retranslation of popular romances is also promoted with the ‘virtue’ of faithfulness. Even in the absence of demand from readers, academics or researchers for a translation that is faithful to the ST, the claim by its publishers that a retranslation attains this, is primarily a marketing strategy. Making readers aware that the first translation was *unfaithful*, strongly suggests that the need for a faithful version, and this is a marketing opportunity. Finally, the nature of a commerce-driven retranslation is closely related to the prevailing market environment. In our case study, the historical but now hugely reduced use of Taiwan’s book rental stores as the primary marketing channel, and the flawed copyright regulations in place between 1970 and 1990 are explanatory of the emergence of the retranslation in 2010.

We share the conclusion of Susam-Sarajeva (2003, 30), that it is too early to try to generalize the phenomenon of retranslation, because “after all, case studies located within diverse socio-cultural situations keep yielding alternative results.” With the onslaught of digital publications, traditional forms of book publishing have been challenged, and this may be another contributory factor in the increased commercially-driven retranslation, as we have discussed in this paper. We hope and

expect that more studies of retranslations of works that are not 'classic', and of commercially-driven retranslations, from a variety of socio-cultural backgrounds, will culminate in a more realistic picture of the phenomenon of retranslation.

REFERENCES

Primary References

Julie, Garwood. 1989. *The Bride*. Waterville, ME: Thorndike Press.

Julie, Garwood. 1990. *The Bride*. Translated by Shalan Liu, Trans. Taipei: Lin Po Publisher.

Julie, Garwood. 2012. *The Bride*. Translated by Adam Tang. Taipei: Star East Press.

Secondary References

Al-Bataineh, A. B. 1998. *The Modern Arabic Novel: A Literary and Linguistic Analysis of the Genre of Popular Fiction, with Special Reference to Translation from English*. PhD, Heriot-Watt University.294

Almberg, S. P. E. 2001. "Retranslation". In *An Encyclopaedia of Translation: Chinese-English, English-Chinese*. S.-w. Chan and D. E. Pollard. 925-930. Hong Kong, The Chinese University Press.

Barlow, L. and J. A. Krentz. 1992. "Beneath the Surface: The Hidden Codes of Romance". In *Dangerous Men and Adventurous Women: Romance Writers on*

- the Appeal of the Romance*. J. A. Krentz. 15-30. Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Press.
- Bianchi, D. and A. D'Arcangelo. 2015. "Translating History or Romance? Historical romantic fiction and its translation in a globalised market." *Linguistics and Literature Studies* 3(5): 248-253.
- Brownlie, S. 2006. "Narrative theory and retranslation theory." *Across Languages and Cultures* 7(2): 145-170.
- Chesterman, A. 2004. "Hypotheses about Translation Universals". In *Claims, Changes and Challenges in Translation Studies: Selected contributions from the EST Congress, Copenhagen 2001*. G. Hansen, K. Malmkjaer and D. Gile. 1-13. Amsterdam, John Benjamins.
- Deane-Cox, S. 2014. *Retranslation: Translation, Literature and Retranslation*. London, Bloomsbury. 210.
- Desmidt, I. 2009. "(Re)translation Revisited." *Meta: Translators' Journal* 54(4): 669-683.
- Genette, G. 1997. *Paratexts: Thresholds of Interpretation*. London, Penguin Books. 427.
- Greenall, A. K. 2015. "Translators' Voices in Norwegian Retranslations of Bob Dylan's Songs." *Target* 27(1): 40-57.

- Koskinen, K. and O. Paloposki. 2003. "Retranslations in the Age of Digital
Reproduction." *Cadernos de tradução* 1(11): 19-38.
- Koskinen, K. and O. Paloposki. 2010. "Retranslation". In *Handbook of Translation
Studies*. Y. Gambier and L. V. Doorslaer. 294-298. Amsterdam, John
Benjamins.
- Kovala, U. 1996. "Translations, Paratextual Mediation, and Ideological Closure."
Target 8(1): 119-147.
- Liu, S.-h. 2012. *The Translation/Mutation of Romantic Love: An Exploration of the
Translation History of Modern Romances in Taiwan after 1960*. PhD PhD
Thesis, National Taiwan Normal University
- Paizis, G. 1998. "Category romances." *The Translator* 4 (1): 1-24.
- Paloposki, O. and K. Koskinen. 2004. "A Thousand and One Translations: Revisiting
Retranslation". In *Claims, Changes, and Challenges: Selected contributions
from the EST Congress, Copenhagen 2001*. G. Hansen, K. Malmkjaer and D.
Gile. 27-38. Amsterdam, John Benjamins.
- Ramsdell, K. 2012. *Romance Fiction: A Guide to the Genre*. Santa Barbara, CA,
Libraries Unlimited.
- Schell, H. 2013. "Brining the Mid-West to the Middle East: An Analysis of a
Harlequin romance in English and Turkish". In *The Silk Road of Adaptation:*

- Transformations across Disciplines and Cultures*. L. Law. 160-171. Newcastle upon Tyne, Cambridge Scholars Publishing.
- Shibamoto Smith, J. S. 2005. "Translating True Love: Japanese Romance Fiction". In *Gender, Sex and Translation: The Manipulation of Identities*. S. Jose. 97-118. London, Routledge.
- Susam-Sarajeva, Ş. 2003. "Multiple-entry Visa to Travelling Theory: Retranslations of Literary and Cultural Theories." *Target* 15(1): 1-36.
- Taivalkoski-Shilov, K. 2015. "Friday in Finnish: A Character's and (Re) translators' Voices in Six Finnish Retranslations of Daniel Defoe's Robinson Crusoe." *Target* 27(1): 58-74.
- Venuti, L. 2004. "Retranslation: The Creation of Value." *Bucknell Review* 47(1): 25-38.
- Xiang, R. 2012. "First Translation and Retranslation in the Historical, Social and Cultural Context: A case study of Two Chinese Versions of Tess of the D'Urbervilles." *Babel* 58(4): 457-470.